Ethics in Early China
An Anthology

Edited by
Chris Fraser, Dan Robins, and Timothy O’Leary

For
Chad Hansen
— colleague, teacher, friend
This publication was generously supported by a subvention from the Department of Philosophy, University of Hong Kong.

Contents

Foreword: The Professor's 他, or the Many-Sided Chad Hansen
Donald J. Munro

Preface

xi

Contributors

xiii

Introduction

1

Part One: New Readings
1. Were the Early Confucians Virtuous?
Roger T. Ames and Henry Rosemont, Jr.

17

2. Mencius as Consequentialist
Manyul Im

41

3. No Need for Hemlock: Mencius’s Defense of Tradition
Franklin Perkins

65

4. Mohism and Motivation
Chris Fraser

83

5. “It Goes beyond Skill”
Dan Robbins

105
Contents

6. The Sounds of Zhèngmíng: Setting Names Straight in Early Chinese Texts
   Jane Geaney
   125

7. Embodied Virtue, Self-Cultivation, and Ethics
   Lisa Raphals
   143

Part Two: New Departures

8. Moral Tradition Respect
   Philip J. Ivanhoe
   161

9. Piecemeal Progress: Moral Traditions, Modern Confucianism, and Comparative Philosophy
   Stephen C. Angle
   175

10. Agon and Hé: Contest and Harmony
    David B. Wong
    197

11. Confucianism and Moral Intuition
    William A. Haines
    217

12. Chapter 38 of the Dàodéjīng as an Imaginary Genealogy of Morals
    Jiwei Ci
    233

13. Poetic Language: Zhuàngzì and Dù Fū's Confucian Ideals
    Lee H. Yeowell
    245

14. Dào as a Naturalistic Focus
    Chad Hansen
    267

Afterword
   Chad Hansen
   297

Index
   303
Virtue ethics, one of the three major contemporary approaches to normative ethics, places emphasis on virtue or moral character. Within the Greek context on which it draws, it is centrally concerned with the key concepts of virtue (areté), practical wisdom (phronesis), and the “good life” (eudaimonia). In this chapter I offer a view of the first two, areté and phronesis, that differs from the prevailing approaches of virtue ethics. I explore Chinese and Greek views of virtue and character derived from self-cultivation practices based on notions of ethics and virtue as specifically embodied and of selves that are “cultivated” by physical practices with an explicitly physical dimension. The immediate occasion for this chapter was the 2008 Summer Olympic Games in Beijing and the implicitly comparative problems they raise about the role of virtue in athletic competition. These problems provide a useful framework for examining broader ethical aspects of embodied Chinese self-cultivation practices. I discuss notions of embodied virtue and self-cultivation in three contexts: early Confucian texts, Daoist and technical works, and finally in a comparative perspective.

An important role of the Olympic Games in Greece was the mediation of inter-polis relations. Needless to say, the problem of harmonizing, pacifying, or aligning various poleis through periods of war and peace did not occur as such in imperial China and arguably did not occur during the periods of non-imperial control, especially the Warring States. So we may speculate at the outset that there is nothing in China that we could, or arguably should, attempt to compare to the Games as a set of sociopolitical and cultural institutions. I argue against that speculation in order to look in a different direction, namely, how self-cultivation was understood. The context of the Games and athletic competition offers an opportunity to consider the role of embodied self-cultivation practices in Warring States and Han China. It also offers an interesting comparative
Self-Cultivation and Athletic Performance

“Sport” is something that has an enduring and transnational appeal, and it might be said that we “recognize it when we see it.” But what do we mean by sport or athletics? Among theorists of the origin of sport, there are three basic approaches, each with its problems: ethnological, Marxist, and religio-ritual. Ethnologists view sport as a manifestation of instinctive behavior. Marxists derive sport from the processes of labor and production. More interesting for present purposes is the view that all sport is based on ritual, sacrifice, and religion: sport has even been defined as “the ritual sacrifice of physical energy” (Sansone 1992, 37). But what does that “sacrifice” involve or presuppose? I want to suggest that, at least in early China, three practices form a continuum:

1. “Athletic” contests that involve skilled and possibly competitive specialized athletic performance, possibly derived from, or assimilated to, combat.
2. Physical exercise, “self-cultivation” regimens, and other related practices understood to “transform the qi” for purposes of health and longevity.
3. Ritual performance that was viewed as a fundamental aspect of the cultivation of virtue and ethics.

It could be argued that these practices had different purposes: competition, moral development, health, and so on. Where they form a continuum is in the nature of the techniques used and the ethos, religio-medical, and metaphysical assumptions behind them.

I argue that Chinese “athletic performances” are based on notions of virtue and self-cultivation. I use these terms beyond the trivial point that athletic excellence, like any other, requires great effort and cultivates, at the very least, the physical self. Aristocratic competitions in archery, chariot racing, and the like were judged not by victory but by quality of performance. They were linked to broadly Ruist (“Confucian”) notions of ethics and virtue. But they are also part of a broader set of “embodied virtue” traditions, based on: (1) the tacit and unexpressed view that mind and body are a continuum rather than a duality, and (2) the explicit view that embodied self-cultivation practices can transform the qi. These include, but are not limited to, athletic performance properly undertaken. This view of embodied virtue is grounded in late Warring States physiognomy and medicine. It was also closely linked to “Daoist” texts, to southern schools (nowadays most visible in excavated texts from the state of Ch'u), and in “moralized” views of health in the traditions that culminated as the Huángdi Nàijīng 黃帝內經.

A Ruist View

Archery Contests in the Analects, Mencius, and Lǐjì

Chinese athletic performances included court competitions in archery and chariot racing, but in some accounts at least, competition was not their primary purpose. Archery appears indirectly in Chinese ritual and historical texts through ritual hunts. The emperor and his officials personally shot game and sacrificed the meat at imperial tombs. But archery as a manifestation of the virtue of the archer first appears in the Analects (Lùxùn 讀論). The Analects refers to ritual archery contests of the nobility, but Confucius praises less the skill of archery than the character of the jūnzi 君子 (gentleman), expressed in noncompetitive behavior. For example, in Analects 3.7 Confucius says, “The jūnzi has nothing over which he contends.” He uses the example of archery; the archer behaves with ritual courtesy and, although in contest with others, remains a jūnzi. Elsewhere Confucius remarks that, in archery, the important point is not hitting the target, because people’s strength is not equal (3.16).

For Mencius (3A:3), archery was one of four traditional institutions that make the people understand human relationships: zǎng 庄 (rearing), xiū 序 (archery), xué 學 (learning), and xiào 校 (teaching). The “Zhōngyōng” 中庸 chapter of the Lǐjì 禘記 also ascribes to Confucius the view that archery revealed moral superiority:

In archery there is something like the jūnzi. When the archer misses the center of the target, he turns round and seeks for the cause in his person.

A Lǐjì chapter devoted to archery describes the conduct and meaning of ceremonial archery contests and explicitly links archery style to character. After describing the general conduct of the archers, it states that “in this way it is possible to observe the virtue (dé 德) of their conduct (xíng 行). The Zhōngyi 射義 makes an explicit link between archery and benevolence, which elaborates on the previous passage: “Archery is a dào 道 of benevolence (rén 仁). The
archer seeks to be correct in himself and then discharges the arrow. Again, if he misses, he is not angry with a superior archer, but seeks the cause of failure in himself.14

Cultivating Radiant Qi

 Nonetheless, the picture presented of ritual athletic activity in explicitly Rusic texts is idealized. We may question whether the archer was not primarily trying to win. But even if he was, the physical practice of archery to describe virtue mirrors other passages in which Mencius emphasizes the importance of embodied virtue. Ritual and other physical performances entail a view of material virtue grounded in the transformation of qi. Let me mention two examples.

In 2A:2, Mencius famously describes qi as filling the body and moved by the will:

The will is commander over the qi, while the qi is that which fills the body. The qi halts where the will arrives.

When Gongsun Chou 公孫丑 asks Mencius about his own particular strengths, he replies:

I understand language, and I am good at nurturing my radiant ("roddish") qi.9

He emphasizes that the radiant qi is difficult to describe but nonetheless gives hints for how to nurture it:

This is a qi which is, in the highest degree, vast and unyielding. If you are straightforward in nourishing it and never harm it, it will fill all the space between heaven and earth. It is a qi that puts together righteousness (yi 義) and Dao 道. Without these, it starves. It is what is born from accumulating righteousness; you cannot win righteousness by luck or grasp it in your hand. (2A:2)

Physiognomy

Given Mencius’s view that virtue arises in part from physical self-cultivation of the qi, we might expect the results also to be visible in the body. In several passages, Mencius does seem to say that self-cultivation transforms the body and its appearance. It is visible in a jade-like countenance and in the appearance of the eyes. In 7A:21, he describes the four virtues of the jianzi (仁 rēn, 義 yi, 禮 li, and zhi 智) rooted in the heartmind and visible in the body. They produce a glossy coloration visible in the face and visible in the limbs. “The four limbs do not speak, but they convey it.”

But if virtue is visible in the body, it should be possible to “read” it, and Mencius effectively defends the practice of physiognomy:

In examining others, nothing is more effective than the pupils. The pupils cannot conceal evil. If that within the chest is upright [zheng 正], the pupils are clear and bright; if it is not, they are clouded. If you listen to their words and examine their pupils, how can people hide anything?10

Xunzi 荀子, by contrast, rejected physiognomy as based on endowments received at birth and thus not an indicator of self-cultivation. In a similar vein, the Han iconoclast Wang Chong 王充 explicitly attacks Mencius’s physiognomy on the grounds that clarity or cloudiness of the eyes is determined at birth and does not depend on character.11 In summary, for Mencius, this theory of qi linked the development of ethics and virtue and the transformed appearance of a sage.12

Embodied Virtue: A Broader Chinese Perspective

Now I turn to a more broadly Chinese view of embodied self-cultivation practices. Mencius’s views about qi conform to and probably draw on a culture of embodied (bodily based) self-cultivation practices, aptly described in a recent book by Mark Czikezentmihalyi. These practices and the concepts behind them structured much of early Daoism, medical theory, and, more broadly, important areas of early Chinese ethics and metaphysics.13 Such “material virtue” traditions held that the body-mind was constructed of qi and that embodied self-cultivation practices could transform qi. Such views informed Warring States accounts of dietary practices, exercise regimens, breath meditation, sexual cultivation techniques, and other technical traditions associated with fangshi 方士 (masters of recipes). Material virtue traditions also had important links with “Daoist” texts and southern schools, as well as potential links to the “moralization” of health in the traditions that culminated as the Huading Neijing. Accounts of these practices appear in passing in the texts of the received tradition. Many more come from texts excavated from tombs.
**Daoist “Virtue” Traditions**

Several early Daoist texts describe what happens when a sage transforms the qi that constitutes the body. Here the emphasis is not visible virtue but actual power.

The *Nèiyì 内黌* clearly refers to cultivation of qi, jīng 精 (vital essence), and shén 神 (spirit), specifying that the cultivation of dé 德 or “power” must be worked on each day, and describes Dào as pervading the person of a sage.

Respectful and cautious, and avoiding excesses, he daily renews his power (dé). He comes to understand everything in the world and thoroughly examines its four extremities.14

The *Zhuāngzǐ 庄子* and other texts refer to the figure of the shén rén 神人 (spirit-person) as someone who has effectively transformed the physical body and the qi that constitutes it. Zhuāngzǐ I describes the shén rén of Guīyè 奧射, who concentrates his shén, avoids the five grains, rides the clouds, and, through the concentration of his shén, “protects creatures from sickness and epidemic and makes the yearly harvest ripen.”15 This passage suggests that a realized sage can have a nurturing effect even on the world at large, by acting at a distance. The *Zhuāngzǐ* does not indicate that these effects are intended; they may be simply a by-product of self-cultivation practices.

Zhuāngzǐ 22 clearly identifies qi as the basis of the physical constitution of the body: “Human birth is caused by the gathering together of qi” (*Zhuāngzǐ* 22: 733). A related strand of fourth-century BCE thinking about embodied virtues stresses the need to regulate the qi of one’s constitution in order to achieve emotional balance. Passages of this kind occur in the Zuó Zhúán 左傳 and the Gùmí 蘇子.16

The *Lǔshī Chānqīu 魯氏春秋* describes how the sages “made their numinous essence (jīng shén) tranquil, and preserved and lengthened their longevity.”17 The *Zhuāngzǐ* also describes harmonizing or taking charge of the six qi:

The qi of heaven is out of harmony, the qi of earth is tangled and snarled. The six qi are out of adjustment, the four seasons are out of order. Now I want to harmonize the essences of the six qi in order to nurture life. (11:386)

There are many other passages that could be added. The point is that a sage or numinous person achieves that status through physical as well as meta-physically, which are not distinguished. Similarly, a broad category of yángshēng 發生 (“self-cultivation” or “nurturing life”) techniques sought physical self-cultivation and longevity. These included therapeutic gymnastics, dietetics, breath cultivation, and sexual cultivation.

**Medicine, Fāng Arts, and Physiognomy in Excavated Texts**

Now I turn to technical texts of a slightly different orientation: health, longevity, and the assessment of the “virtues” of people and objects. For example, many titles of medical manuscripts excavated from tombs describe techniques for self-cultivation through dietary, exercise, and sexual practices. These fragments and titles suggest the extent to which early self-cultivation techniques were linked to magico-medical and technical expertise traditions.

Most of these texts do not survive in the received tradition, but we can get some idea of their contents from the titles of lost texts in the *Hánshā 漢書* *Yuánzhǐ 輸詐*28. It lists the titles of texts in the imperial library under six categories in an explicitly descending hierarchy that created a paradigm used by subsequent compendia to classify texts. 19 So, even though many of the titles are no longer extant, they provide a guide to categories of knowledge used by Hán thinkers. Most useful here are the last two of the six sections of the treatise, “Numbers and Techniques” (*Shāshā 數術*) and “Recipes and Methods” (*Fāngjí 方技*).

The “Recipes and Methods” section includes the *Huángdì Néijìng* as well as the titles of other medical works concerned with physical cultivation, health, and longevity. For example, the *jīngfāng 經方* subsection includes “Recipes for Married Women and Infants” and “Food Prohibitions of Shèn Nóng 神農 and Huáng Di 黃帝” (*Hánshā* 30:1777–78).

The sexual arts section includes five texts titled “The Yin Way” (*yīn dào* 陰道), ascribed to Yāo 姚 and Shén 神 and other putative masters. 20 It also includes a “Yīn and Yáng of [the star god] Tian Yī 天一,” “Recipes for Nurturing Yáng of Huáng Di and the Sage-Kings,” and “Inner Chamber Recipes of the Three Schools for Having Children.”

Other sections describe physical exercises and therapeutic techniques, such as “Stepping and Pulling Book of Huáng Di and Other Masters,” “Massage of Huáng Di and Qī Bó 培和,” and several titles on fungi and mushrooms and household recipes (*jiàng Méi 方菜*).

The subject matter of these texts is borne out by medical and esoteric texts excavated from Mǎwángduó 馬王堆 (Chángshā, Húnán, 168 BCE). 21 For example, “Eliminating Grain and Eating Vapor” concerns dietetics and breath cultivation. 22 “Drawings of Guiding and Pulling” is a series of forty-four drawings of human figures performing exercises, some with captions. Some are described in another excavated text, the *Yǐnshā 引書* or “Pulling Book” from Zhāngjīlǎnshān 張家山 (Jiāngfíng, Húběi). Both exemplify a tradition of exercise for both therapy and health known as dàoyǐn 拔引 (pulling and guiding). “Recipes for Nurturing Life” consists of eighty-seven recipes, including food, drugs, and beverages, along with several sexual cultivation exercises. “Various...
Restricted Recipes” is a series of charms, including remedies for marital problems and crying babies and love charms to secure the affections of another. “Harmonizing Yin and Yang” and “Discussion of the Culminant Way of All under Heaven” refer to the movements and postures of animals as whole-body metaphors for sexual techniques.\textsuperscript{23} The Yinshu also describes exercises that refer to or are named after animals, including inchworms, snakes, mantises, wild ducks, owls, tigers, chickens, bears, frogs, deer, and dragons.

In summary, most of the above texts can be described as part of a “y"ngshng"ng 養 生 culture,” which offered and emphasized control over the physiological processes of the body and mind, understood as transformations of qi. These transformations were understood as self-cultivation in the concomitants of moral excellence, health, and longevity (rather than medical pathology) and physiological transformation through the manipulation of qi.\textsuperscript{24}

**Physiognomy**

If the transformed qi of a cultivated individual was visible in the body, the corollary was that a skilled individual could “read” these transformations. In theory at least, the ability to physiognomize persons and things allowed a skilled reader to assess the merit, not only of individuals but of animals and plants used in agriculture, and even of material used in warfare.

Within the transmitted tradition, texts on physiognomy appear in the “Numbers and Techniques” section of the H"anshu Yiw"enzh"i. All the texts are lost, but their titles give an indication of their concerns, including a range of titles on practical physiognomy: “Military Prohibitions and Physiognomizing Clothing and Material,” “Sh"en N"ong’s Cultivations of Fields, Physiognomizing the Earth, and Plowing and Planting,” “Planting Trees, Storing Fruit, Physiognomizing Silkworms,” “Physiognomizing People,” “Physiognomizing Precious Swords and Knives,” and “Physiognomizing Six Kinds of Animals” (H"anshu 30: 1773–75).

These titles suggest the practical and technical uses to which these skills were put. Physiognomy could be used to assess the economic worth of objects (clothing, equipment, swords), animals (domestic animals, silkworms), and people. Excavated texts on physiognomy emphasize these practical contexts, for example, a text from Yin"qu"sh"an 永 青山 (Linyi, Sh"andong c. 140–118 BCE) on the physiognomizing of dogs, a Han sword physiognomy text from Juy"n 姬 延 (G"ansu), and a text on the physiognomy of horses from M"aw"angdui. All share the view that internal qi is reflected in appearance and makes it possible to judge character or potential. In economic and military contexts, this meant judging the “character” of an animal or weapon.

**A Comparative Perspective**

In conclusion, I turn to the problem of comparing Greek and Chinese views of what, in both cases, look like athletic performance.\textsuperscript{25} In Greek views of sport as competitive, there are clear winners and losers but also a morality of competition that puts virtue ahead of victory. In the Chinese case, what on the surface looks like competitive sport may be something very different.

There is an apparent incommensurability between Greek and Chinese sport. Greek sport was centralized, democratic, competitive, external, and aesthetic (in some contexts erotic). Chinese sport was local, hierarchical, non-competitive, internal, and in some contexts imitative of the whole body movements of animals.\textsuperscript{26} Needless to say, very different social structures and institutions underlie these differences. Both are linked to ritual and sacrifice, but in different ways. Although a definition of sport as the sacrifice of energy may apply to Chinese sport, it is not clear that it has the same purchase in China as in Greece.

In Greece the connection between athletic contests, competition, and sacrifice (including the sacrifice of animal victims, libations, and feasts) is much older than the establishment of the Olympic Games in 776 BCE.\textsuperscript{27} For example, the Homeric poems devote the better part of a book of the Iliad to the funeral games for Patroclus and describe at length the ad hoc games held in honor of Odysseus at the court of King Alkinoos.\textsuperscript{28} The heroic ethos of competition became a part of such games: “always to be best and to surpass others” (Iliad 6.208). Such excellence was encouraged by the perceived approbation, or even active participation, of a divine audience.

There is also a “dark side” of Greek sport, involving its attitudes toward cunning and deception, the morally ambiguous quality of “practical and cunning intelligence” the Greeks called m"etis.\textsuperscript{29} In Iliad 23, Nestor advises his son Antilochus to use m"etis in the chariot race, because Antilochus is disadvantaged by slow horses that will mar his chances of victory. He urges his son to fill up your spirit with every kind of m"etis, which will enable him to prevail.

> The horses of these men are faster, but they themselves do not understand this art any more than you.
>
> But come my dear son, fill up your spirit with every kind of m"etis

so that the prize may not elude you.

> The woodman does more by m"etis than by force;
> by m"etis the helmsman holds his swift ship on course, though torn by winds, over the wine-dark sea, and so by m"etis one charioteer can outpace another. (Iliad 23.311–18)
Nestor instructs his son to make a tight turn at the post, potentially cutting off another driver. This strategy will give him a clear shot, even with slower horses. This example illustrates a second characteristic of mētis: its close links to physical action.

The “deceptions” of the Sāni 孫子 general or the wily Odysseus are a far cry from the “virtues” and ethics advocated by Confucius or Plato. But all are models of sagacity, very differently understood. Interestingly, each case has its counterpart in sport (and also in metaphors that compare sport to wisdom or moral excellence). These accounts show very different morals of competition, along with complex relations between virtue, victory, performance, and entertainment. They also draw on very different metaphysics.

How much must we be put off by these? Can we reconcile an apparent Greek mind-body dichotomy with a Chinese metaphysics in which mind and body are a continuum, or even inseparable? Do we find ourselves in a glen of incommensurable?

I would argue that we do not. Both Greek athletics and Chinese-embodied self-cultivation practices (and their athletic aspects) are based on notions of ethics, virtue, and self-cultivation. The social and institutional contexts for their expression differ greatly, as do Greek and Chinese epistemologies and metaphysics.

Greek sport is based on notions of virtue and self-cultivation in several senses, beginning with its ancient connections with sacrifice, in which the athlete is a willing offering. Any sacrificial victim must be the best of its kind, and an athlete achieves this status through competition. A second sense of self-cultivation is the wholehearted effort and concentration that victory requires, in which human virtue or aretē is understood as a unitary whole of which athletic eminence is a part. Thus understood, athletic competition is a demonstration of the virtue of the athlete, rather than a form of technical expertise. That virtue is expressed in effort, in the discipline of training, in the sacrifice of time and money, and in the willingness to risk defeat and disgrace (Fränkel 1975, 487–88). A third notion of virtue derives from the Greek ideal of balance between the two modes of excellence of mind and body (in which the two are viewed as profoundly different).

The Chinese evidence also urges us to reconsider conventional accounts of Greek philosophy that treat mind and body as profoundly separate. Such views may derive in part from accounts of the mind-body problem in Plato and Aristotle. However, other Greek traditions unite mind and body in ways that warrant further exploration, for example, the view that moral virtue could and should manifest through the body as kalos kagathos (good to look at and good in action). Another example is the linkage of health with virtue and ethics, for example in a fragment by Sophocles:

Most beautiful of all is to be just; best is to live without disease, and sweetest the means to seize each day what one desires.

To conclude, as we have seen, the classical Confucian representation of archery stressed the expression of the character of the jūnzi, despite the fact that bow and arrow were also military weapons with a long history of use in combat. But archery was also part of a spectrum of embodied practices which expressed, and transformed, the virtues of the practitioner. Other self-cultivation practices included gymnastics, longevity practices, and arguably the quotidian activities of cooking and medicine. In these practices, mind and body are a continuum that warrants comparison to Greek views, dualist and otherwise.

**Notes**

1. This in contrast to deontology and consequentialism. For virtue ethics, see Hursthouse (2009).
2. Two Panhellenic institutions, the Olympic Games and the oracle of Apollo at Delphi, were particularly important for cooperation in inter-polis relations in ancient Greece. See Tod (1913).
3. The Marxist definition does not account for the pursuit of health or longevity. The ethological view is better suited to play (with its biological or evolutionary functions) than to sport. The religio-rationalist approach has suffered from methodological problems. The prevalence of religious and ritual aspects of sport has been widely noted. See Sansone (1992, 15–28).
4. The present discussion focuses on archery because of its specific association with Confucian virtue. It was one of several modes of athletic competition associated with military training, including chariot racing, jumping and throwing, wrestling, swimming, boating, ball kicking and running, and chess. Other recreational athletic activities included lifting heavy objects, acrobatics, dancing, and games of accuracy (such as throwing arrows into a wine bottle or hitting a wood pack). Yet other activities were linked to seasonal festivals, such as lion dances, walking on stilts, and flying kites. Finally, some broadly athletic procedures were exercises for health, including “exercises for pulling” (dǎo yīn, discussed below) and “marital arts” (wānhuà 舞術), including both hand and sword methods. Both dǎo yīn and wānhuà were linked to the movements of animals. See Ren (1988, ch. 2, 55–90).
5. These sacrifices are described in the Zuó Zhūn 左傳 and systematized in the Zhōu lí 周禮. See Lewis (1990, 145–51).
9. For discussion of "floodlike" and "radiant" as translations for hàodàn 浩然, see Csikszentmihalyi (2004, 152–56, especially note 122).


11. Lünhuáng 孫陽, "Bên xìng" 13, 135 (Forke 1911, 1.385).

12. Mark Csikszentmihalyi argues that a "material virtue" tradition of "embodied" virtues developed as a response to criticisms of Ruist ritual, initially in the Mòzǐ 孟子 and Zhìzàng 趙子. At issue was whether these "archaic" (and expensive) practices were a genuine element in self-cultivation and the creation of social order. One Rú 魯 defense against this critique was a claim for an authentic practice. See Csikszentmihalyi (2004, 59).

13. For an excellent summary of these, see Lo (2005).


16. "People have love and hate, pleasure and anger, sorrow and joy. These are born from the six qi. Therefore be careful to choose your models from the fitting categories in order to regulate the six intensions" (Zuò Zhūn 趙敦, 25.3, 1458). A similar fourth-century BCE passage from the Guànzi describes the responses of the sage-kings to the six emotions: "Love and hate, pleasure and anger, and sorrow and joy are the transformations of life. Clear perception and appropriate responses to things are the virtues of life. Therefore the sage kings were moderate in satisfying their tastes and timely in their movement and repose. They rectified and controlled the transformations of the six qi and prohibited excess in sound and color" (Guànzi X, 26, 2a). This translation is based on the Sīpú Bēiyāo text but is indebted to Rickett 1:379. I follow Rickett's practice of using Roman numerals for jùn 階 and Arabic numerals for pían 篇 and page numbers (see Rickett 1985, 1:47).

17. Lüshi Chāngqì 魯史昌時 (Lüshi Chunqí), 5.2, 35–4a.

18. The thirteenth chapter of the Hànshù (Han history) is a "Bibliographic Treatise" (Yiwēnzhi 予以論), compiled in the first century CE by Bàn Gū 班固 (32–92), based on earlier compilations by the Han court bibliographers and exegetes Liú Xiáng 劉向 (79–8 BCE) and his son Liú Xīn 劉歆 (46 BCE – 23 CE). Liú Xiáng's "Separate Listings" (Biěsī 別世) was initiated by Han Chéng Di 漢成帝, (r. 32–7 BCE) in 26 BCE. Liú Xīn abridged it under the title of Seven Epitomes (Qiúqí 謹其). The Shǐshū 散氏 section was compiled by the grand astrologer Yīn Xiàn 尹咸; and, not surprisingly, gives precedence to the astrological divination methods that fell within the purview of his office.

19. Hànshù 30.1701–84. The categories are: (1) the "Six Arts" (Liùyì 六藝); (2) "Six Classics" (Liùjīng 六經); (3) "Masters" (Zhīzì 賢哲); (4) poetry (Shīshū 歌詩); (5) military works (Bīngshū 兵書); (6) "Numbers and techniques (Shùshù)"; (7) "Recipes and methods" (Fángì)

20. Other putative authors include Róng Chéng 融成, Wù Chéngzǐ 胡成子, Táng Pāngtāng 唐勳, and Táo Lào and other masters 天老類子.

21. The Mǎwǎngdū 萬王墓 medical corpus consists of eleven medical manuscripts written on three sheets of silk. They reflect Warring States medical traditions of the third and second centuries BCE, before the cosmological correspondence theories of the Hánngdǐ 汉代. Several reflect embodied self-cultivation traditions. The importance of this site is well known for its two versions of the Làozi 老子 and its medical texts on yīnyíng 血陰 theory and acuæma.

22. Eliminating grain is accomplished with the aid of both breathing exercises performed at morning and evening, and by eating the herb shìwèi 石韋. The text also contains a seasonal regimen of breath cultivation through consuming six qi and avoiding another five. For translations of these texts see Harper (1998). For a survey of the corpus, see Harper (1998, 25–30).

23. For example, the description of the "Ten postures" in "Harmonizing yīn and yáng": the first is "tiger roving"; the second is "cicada clinging"; the third is "measuring worm"; the fourth is "river deer butting"; the fifth is "locust splayed"; the sixth is "gibbon grabbing"; the seventh is "toad"; the eighth is "rabbit biting"; the ninth is "dragonfly"; the tenth is "fish gobbling" (Harper 1998, 418).

24. For an excellent summary, see Lo (2001).

25. Most Greek terms are transliterated according to the third edition of the Oxford Classical Dictionary. Unless otherwise indicated, Greek texts are from Loeb Classical Library editions. Translations are my own unless otherwise indicated.


27. For an overview of the history of the relation between religion and Greek sport, see Scalon (2002), especially ch. 1.

28. For the funeral games, see liùxū 23.256–257 ror the games for Odyssey, see Odyssey 8.97–384. There is also a spontaneous boxing match between Odyssey and the beggar Ilos (18.66–897).


30. Plato first poses the problem as the connection between an immortal soul and a mortal body in the Phaedo 82e–86d, Phaedrus 246a–254a, and Republic 439c–441b. For an overview, see Robinson (2002). Aristotle's position on the nature of the soul is more difficult to characterize, and there is no scholarly agreement on this subject. See van der Eijk (2002) and edited volumes by Lloyd and Owen (1978) and Nussbaum and Rorty (1992).

31. See Dover (1974), 41–45. Dover emphasizes that (like júnzǐ) this term denotes an elite social class as well as a moral elite.


References


