Journal of Chinese Philosophy

LISA RAPHALS

DIVINATION AND AUTONOMY: NEW PERSPECTIVES FROM EXCAVATED TEXTS

History is written by the victors. Much of the philosophical discussion of excavated texts has centered on the Guodian and Shanghai Museum texts, which augment or comment on the texts of the received tradition. This perspective omits the counterparts and competitors of the Warring States philosophers: the technical experts. The technical expertise traditions (medicine, the mantic arts, and astrocalendrics) were the counterparts and competitors of the philosophers, and far outnumber them in the perhaps narrow context of tomb texts.

Both the received tradition and excavated texts attest to contact and competition between mantic experts and the "schoolmen" associated with Masters texts. Both livelihoods relied on literacy and specialist expertise. Both claimed access to divine knowledge and authority. Their competition thus involved career choice, patronage, students, and the status of modes of knowledge.

In addition, it is now widely agreed that the bases of cosmological speculation first appeared in the ideas and methods of Warring States technical specialists, whose terms and techniques were later incorporated into the *yin-yang* 陰陽 and Five-phase theories of Han cosmology. This view was first argued by Angus Graham some twenty years ago, and third-century excavated texts on these technical arts have reinforced it by supplementing the sparser record in the received tradition.[1] In particular, technical experts were responsible for several developments that contributed to systematic thought and cosmology. These include (i) interest in symmetry, already visible in the oracle bone inscriptions; (ii) the articulation of a *yin-yang* polarity, abstracted as patterns of change, represented by numbers. These patterns were elaborated and nuanced in the hexagrams of the *Zhouyi* 《周易》; (iii) interest in astronomy and calendrics as systematic models of space and time; and (iv) systematic theories of physiognomy. All were based on observation of natural phenomena.

LISA RAPHALS, Professor, Department of Philosophy, National University of Singapore. Specialties: Chinese, comparative philosophy, history of science. E-mail: philar@nus.edu.sg

Journal of Chinese Philosophy, Supplement to Volume 37 (2010) 124–141

We see these interests reflected in the Numbers and Techniques (*shushu* 數術) category of the *Hanshu*《漢書》"*Yiwenzhi*〈藝文志〉," which is dominated by astronomy (*tianwen* 天文) and calendrics (*lipu* 歷譜), but also includes sections on prognostication by the Five Agents (*wuxing* 五行, including portents and omens), turtle and yarrow (*shigui* 蓍龜), diverse prognostications (*zazhan* 雜占, including oneiromancy, augury, and exorcism), and Morphomancy (*xingfa* 刑法, including physiognomy).[2] Historical narratives also provide many examples of the use of these methods in official and private contexts. Finally, when we turn to the tombs of actual government administrators and high officials, what they chose to have buried with them was technical works on the mantic arts and longevity.

Mantic texts offer important philosophical perspectives that receive little voice in the received tradition. I consider them under three headings: (i) their implications for questions of autonomy, fatalism, and freewill; (ii) naturalistic attitudes toward the cosmos, especially in astrocalendric texts; and (iii) notions of embodied virtue and self-cultivation, especially in texts on physiognomy.

I. Autonomy, Fatalism, and Freewill

Mantic texts suggest a different discourse on fatalism and freewill than the arguments about *ming* and mantic practice within the received tradition.

1. Masters Texts

In the *Lunyu*《論語》, 6.22, Confucius famously recommends a respectful distance from "ghosts and spirits." A similar attitude appears in a text from Mawangdui 馬王堆 (Changsha, Hunan, 168), titled *Yao*《要》(Essentials) by modern editors. Here Confucius claims that cultivating virtue is superior to the mantic expertise of incantators and *wu* (*zhu wu bu shi* 祝巫卜筮). Yet in the same text, when asked whether he believes in prognostication by yarrow stalks, he replies that he has performed one hundred *Yi* divinations and seventy were correct.[3] The *Lunyu* never refers to Confucius personally prognosticating with the *Zhouyi*, but other texts in the received tradition do, for example, the *Lüshi Chunqiu*:

> Kongzi prognosticated and obtained Bi 賁; he said: "Inauspicious." Zigong said: "But Bi is also good, why do you call it inauspicious?" Confucius replied: "White should be white and black should be black; how can Bi be good?"[4]

Several Masters texts include a variety of claims for the superiority of Masters over mantic traditions. Several compare their eponymous Masters favorably with mantic specialists of various kinds. Both the *Mozi* and the *Lüshi chunqiu* include debates in which a Master gets the better of a *wu* 巫 (or someone with the name Wuma 巫馬, lit. *wu* horse).[5] The *Lüshi chunqiu* recounts a conversations between Confucius and two disciples, the political reformer Fu Zijian 宓子賤 and Wuma Qi 巫馬旗, both governors of Shanfu 單父 in *Lu*. When Fu tries to explain his philosophy of government, Wuma Qi cannot grasp it:

> I depend on people but you depend on force. Depending on force makes you labor; depending on people makes you relaxed.[6]

The passage continues that Fu Zijian was a *junzi*. Relaxed and perceptive, he cultivated his heart-mind and his *qi*, and as a result, governed without effort. Wuma Qi by contrast wore himself out, used up his energies and labored with his limbs. He maintained order in government, but was never equal to Fu Zijian. These passages emphasize the *wu's* incomprehension and inferior methods relative to those of the *junzi*.

In the *Zhuangzi* and *Guanzi* we find a stronger attack on mantic specialists: claims that the mantic arts are inferior to understanding of *dao*. In *Zhuangzi* 23, when someone asks Laozi about "the classic of life," he replies:

> Can you embrace the One? Can you not lose it?
>
> Can you understand good and ill auspice without turtle shell or yarrow?
>
> Can you stop? Can you let it go?[7]

The *Guanzi* describes this understanding in the chapter "Inward Training (*Nei Ye* 〈內業〉)." It tells us how: by concentrating *qi*:

> Concentrate your qi like a spirit, and the myriad things will be inside your hand.
>
> Can you concentrate; can you unify? Can you predict good and ill auspice without turtle shell or yarrow? Can you stop? Can you let it go? Can you not seek it in others but achieve it in yourself?[8]

The *Guanzi* chapter "Clarifying the Heartmind (*Bai Xin* 〈白心〉)" uses similar language to describe the conduct of a sage, who also eschews the mantic arts of astrology:

> He does not use sun and moon, but his affairs are accomplished by them.
>
> He does not prognosticate by turtle shell or yarrow, but skillfully predicts good and ill auspice.[9]

All these statements contrast the equanimity of the sage with the frenetic manipulations of the mantic specialist. Nonetheless, some Masters texts do recommend the mantic arts for practical purposes: the Moists for defensive strategy; the *Guanzi* to determine portents and to protect rulers.[10]

Despite these critiques, most Masters texts considered the mantic arts normal and acceptable, even if they sometimes chose to distance themselves its practitioners or directed claims to universal knowledge against the "limitations" of technical specialists. Masters texts also argued about *ming* 命 (fate or destiny), but these debates were distinct from critiques of divination. Masters texts debated the nature of *ming*, *w*hether it was predetermined, predictable, moral, or mechanical in operation, and whether it was subject to human or divine intervention. For example, both Xunzi and Han Fei argue that prayer and divination do not cause good or bad fortune, but neither pursues the issues of determinism or causality beyond asserting their absence.[11]

2. Fate and Freewill in Mantic Texts

In contrast to the accounts of Masters texts, mantic texts provide concrete methods for the practical management of fate and imply a very different set of attitudes toward fatalism and freewill than the debates of the received tradition. Here we find the mantic arts reflecting tacit notions of personal and moral autonomy and individual agency. Excavated texts address issues of *individual* autonomy that fall below the radar of dominant Ru discussions of political agency and political autonomy. Some present methods to understand and control the future (personal and political) through prognostication. These traditions appear in several distinctly different kinds of text: (i) Mantic texts, including the *Zhouyi* and its predecessors (of which four versions have been excavated from tombs) and almanacs and other astrocalendric texts, especially Daybooks. (ii) Quasi-archival records of personal prognostication. We do not know the original sources of these records or why they were placed in tombs. They clearly were not intended for ongoing consultation by the living. Nonetheless we may be tempted to consider them archives insofar as they were deliberately assembled collections of mantic queries. (iii) Procedures and methods. Ritual texts such as the *Liji* and *Yili* give detailed accounts of mantic procedures and methods, but they have no equivalent in excavated texts. For example, prognostication records from Baoshan 包山 (Jingmen 荊門, Hubei, *c*. 316) give detailed directions for apotropaic sacrifices on behalf of the tomb's occupant. Legal texts from Zhangjiashan 張家山 (Jiangling, Hubei, 186) include instructions for

the appointment of mantic personnel.[12] (iv) In addition, technical astrocalendric texts and instruments excavated from Qin and Han tombs are of increasing sophistication.

Of these four, records of personal prognostication are particularly interesting for purposes of the present discussion, insofar as they indicate attitudes toward the malleability of fate. Third-century records from Warring States tombs from Tianxingguan 天星觀 (Jiangling 江陵, Hubei, *c.* 340), Baoshan and Wangshan 望山 (Hubei, *c.* 309–278) contain records of prognostications performed on behalf of the tombs; occupants. The oldest are from Tianxingguan, the most extensive and well preserved from Baoshan.[13] They have no equivalent in the received textual tradition.

These records document attempt to predict success over a given period of time in what Chen Wei has described as Year (*sui* 歲) and Illness (*jibing* 疾病) divinations.[14] Year divinations sought to verify success over the ensuing year, for example in the Baoshan records:

> 自刑 尸之月以庚刑尸之月，出入事王，盡卒歲，躬身尚毋又(有)咎。
>
> From [this year's month] Xingyi to up to the next Xingyi, coming and going [lit. exiting and entering] in service to the king, for the entire year, may his [physical] person be without calamity.[15]

Year divination seems to have been a standard sequence, performed to ascertain (or establish) success in official service to the king. Illness divinations at Baoshan and other Warring States sites punctuate what seems to have been a normal sequence of Year divinations; and appear after the manifestation of a health problem.[16] For example, the Baoshan Illness divinations begin:

> 傍腹疾，以少氣，尚毋又(有)咎。占之，貞吉，少未已，以其古(故)祝之。薦於野地主一豭，宮地主一豭，賽於行一白犬、酒食，占之曰：吉，刑尸且見王。
>
> There is an illness near the abdomen with shortness of breath; may there be no calamity. He prognosticated about it: the prognostication is auspicious; it is slight but it has not stopped; get rid of it according to its cause. He made offerings: one billy goat to the Lord of the Wild Lands, one billy goat to the Lord of the Grave. He performed *sai* [repayment] sacrifice to the Lord of the Path [Xing] with one white dog and wine oblations. He prognosticated about it: it is auspicious. In the month *xingyi* he [Shao Tuo] will have an audience with the king.[17]

Subsequent prognostications indicate a worsening condition, possibly (but not necessarily) deriving from the initial ailment. They end with the death of the tomb's occupant.

These records indicate attempts to manage personal fate through prayer and sacrifice. These attempts continue until very shortly before

the death of the consultor. We do not know whether the occupant of the Baoshan tomb believed that his life span was fated at birth. We do know that he made every attempt to extend it through mantic procedures to address an illness or illnesses.

Such procedures are designed to prevent, or to redress, dangers and difficulties. In this sense they are negative. Their positive equivalent is questions about good auspice. We also find references to auspicious omens and auspicious days for particular activities in excavated text versions of the *Zhouyi*, in astrocalendric texts and in divination records, the latter also indicating prayers and sacrifices to specific gods. But if there are negotiations with gods and spirits to reach a desired result, there must be an active agent doing the negotiating, or even attempting to supplant divine powers through self-cultivation.[18] The assumption that humans could communicate with extra-human powers was part of a common Shang-Zhou religious heritage, based on the assumption of an inseparable connection between the human and extra-human worlds, visible in signs that could reveal information about the future and be used to enhance personal welfare, in sum, a belief in predictability and in the mutability of fate. Examples of what Poo Mu-chou 蒲慕州 has referred to as a *do ut des* (literally, "I give that you may give") interaction include records of divination and sacrifices to gods and ancestors.[19] In summary, excavated mantic texts and prognostication records show ongoing interest in the management of personal fate.

II. Astrocalendrics and Naturalism

Astrocalendric texts present a quasi-mechanical and naturalistic view of the cosmos that differs from most philosophical treatments of Heaven. They also bespeak an early empirical interest in the systematic mapping and observation of the heavens. These methods depend on comprehensive and systematic representations of time (the sexagenary cycle) and space (correlative divisions of heaven and earth), often expressed in terms of *yin* and *yang* and the Five Agents. The use of these traditions is well represented in the technical treatises of the received tradition.[20] Excavated texts and instruments provide a different account of *yin-yang* and the Five Agents.

1. Abstraction in Mantic Texts

In both the early versions of the *Zhouyi* excavated from tombs and in other excavated texts and archaeological evidence, we see the early association of mantic statements with sequences of numbers. Both

Shang and Western Zhou metaphysics seem to have included the belief that aleatory procedures could reveal information about the good or ill auspice of an intended action.[21] Evidence from excavated texts on the origins of the *Zhouyi* indicates that omen statements were classified under the headings of the hexagrams. The availability and simplicity of these procedures (especially contrasted with bone and shell prognostication), and omen statements concerned with aspects of day-to-day life, suggest their use to optimize the effects of choices and life decisions.

Records of such number sequences first appear in Shang sites and become more prominent in Warring States prognostication records, where yarrow divinations are described as number sequences.[22] The linkage of number sequences and omens occurs in two of the four *Yi* texts (documents concerned with the *Zhouyi*) excavated from tombs, which provide evidence on the early evolution and variety of *Yi* traditions. The *Guicang Yi* text from Wangjiatai 王家台 (Jiangling, Hubei, 278–207) includes fifty-three hexagrams, each followed by the word *yue* 曰 and a statement of the form: [Hexagram Name] says: "In the past, X requested a prognostication about Y from Z; Z prognosticated and said: (in)auspicious." For example:

> 叁節曰，昔者武王卜伐殷而支占老考老考占曰吉
>
> 1-1-6-6-1-6 Jie says: In ancient times Wu Wang divined about attacking the Yin [Shang] and requested a divination from Lao Kao. Lao Kao prognosticated and said: Auspicious.[23]

These statements refer to legendary and historical events and are completely unlike the hexagram statements of the *Zhouyi*.

The Fuyang 阜陽 *Zhouyi* (Shuanggudui 雙古堆, Fuyang, Anhui, 165) consists of fragmentary bamboo slips of some fifty-two hexagrams and line statements. It uses numbers to represent hexagram lines and indicates the importance of line statements for particular topics, such as weather, punishment, warfare, illness, marriage, residence, pregnancy and birth, bureaucratic service, administration, travel, hunting, and fishing. For example, the hexagrams *Da You* 大有 and *Wu Wang* 無妄 both append the statement: "Prognosticating about rain: it will not rain" (*Bu yu bu yu* 卜雨不雨).[24] The hexagram *Sui* 隨 adds a reference to prognosticating about illness.[25]

The other two versions attest to the antiquity of the received text. The Shanghai Museum text, the oldest known *Yi* text, consists of bamboo slips or fragments of thirty-four hexagrams. It corresponds to the received text in many ways and indicates that a stable version of something like the received *Zhouyi* was in circulation by three hundred, but that its mantic interpretations were still flexible at this

time.[26] The Mawangdui *Zhouyi*, the most complete of the excavated documents, includes the *Xici* commentary. It differs from the received text in the order of the hexagrams and their names and diagrams. There are also four previously unknown commentaries, which suggest the early existence of a Ru *Yi* tradition, professional *Yi* diviners, and ambivalent attitudes of Ru toward them.

This history suggests several roles of the *Yi* as a mantic text used for prediction and decision. First, it linked omen statements to cosmic patterns, expressed as sequences of numbers. Second, its was applicable to daily life. In particular, it could advise decisions about areas of potential risk or danger, such as bad weather, illness, warfare, travel, and so forth.[27]

2. Daybooks

Mantic statements on decisions in daily life also appear in daybooks (*rishu* 日書), where they are linked to the calendar and the sexagenary cycle. Daybooks and other almanac texts have been excavated from tombs, beginning with a calendric diagram known as the Chu Silk Manuscript (Changsha, Hunan, *c*. 300).[28] Some resemble the Monthly Ordinance texts of the received tradition. For example, the text titled Prohibitions (*Jin* 禁) from Yinqueshan 銀雀山 (Linyi, Shandong, 140–111) provides seasonal prohibitions linked to the calendar and four (of the five) phases. Most important for the present discussion are the daybooks excavated from some twenty tombs.[29] Daybooks are not almanacs in the strict sense because they do not cover the entire calendar systematically, but they do correlate the calendar to a regular set of transformations: in this case the Five Agents, rather than planetary movements.[30]

Daybooks were used to predict auspicious times for a wide range of activities such as marriage, childbirth, making clothes, building projects, travel, slaughtering farm animals, farming, and official audiences. Other topics included desertion, dreams, illness and leisure, and military activities. Their content reflects the interests of women as well as men (e.g., a prospective wife's wealth and character, a woman's chances of being abandoned). These concerns indicate perceived areas of risk and danger in daily life.[31]

Daybooks present a mechanical view of the workings of fate, for example in the sections on illness in the daybooks for Jiudian and Shuihudi. The Jiudian daybook is the oldest text known to use horary iatromancy. All illnesses that arise on the same day have the same etiology and prognosis: respite, recovery, or death. One section gives auspicious and inauspicious aspects of the Twelve Earth branches and associates each with the onset of a particular illness.

For example, if an illness begins on a *chen* 辰 day, respite occurs on a *you* 酉 day, recovery on a *xu* 戌 day, and death on a *zi* 子 day. If the onset is on a *wei* 未 day, respite occurs on a *zi* day, recovery on a *mao* 昴 day, and death on a *yin* 寅 day, and so on.[32] The two daybooks from Shuihudi are better preserved and include extensive sections on stem-branch iatromancy, with systematic correlation to the Five Agents. For example, Daybook A links the day of onset of an illness to a divine and a material cause:

> 甲乙有疾，父母為祟，得之於肉，從東方來，裹以黍（漆）器。戊己病，庚有閒，辛酢。若不酢，煩居東方，歲在東方，青色死。
>
> If there is illness on a *jia* or *yi* day, father and mother are the calamity, it is obtained from meat, and comes from the east, and is placed in a lacquer container. It manifests on a *wu* or *ji* day, there is a respite on a *geng* day and recovery on a *xin* day. If there is no recovery, Fever will be in the east quarter, Year will be in the east quarter, and the color of death will be azure.[33]

According to this formula, an illness manifests after four days, with a respite on the fifth or sixth day. Recovery occurs on the sixth or seventh day. If the illness does not resolve during this one-week period, it is attributed to Fever (*fan* 煩), associated with the star Year (Sui 歲), which transits over the four directions four times a year.[34] If both Fever and Year are in the quadrant associated with its origin, the illness is fatal. These hemerological methods contrast with the Illness prognostications from Baoshan and Wangshan. The daybooks are no longer apotropaic; they classify illnesses systematically into types to determine auspicious days for treatment.

3. Astrocalendric Texts and Instruments

Attempts to link predictions to cosmological cycles also appear in the use of diviner's boards and astrocalendric tables and instruments. Diviner's boards are models of the cosmos in which a round Heaven plate revolves within a square Earth plate. The earliest known is a Dipper board (*shi pan* 式盤) from Wangjiatai Tomb 15, used to orient the handle of the North Dipper among the Twenty-eight Lunar Lodges *(xiu* 宿).[35] An illustrated text from Zhoujiatai 周家台 discusses the use of the diviner's board. It shows the Ten Heaven Stems positioned in a cruciform figure at the center of the board.[36] The outer circle associates the four cardinal directions with the Twelve Earth Branches, the Five Agents, and the Lunar Lodges. There is an observation or prognostication for each Lunar Lodge, for example, "Sun emerges" (Room, East), "Sun at the center" (Seven Stars, South), and "Sun enters" (Pleiades, West). To obtain a prognostication, the

Heaven plate was keyed to the month and solar lodge associated with the time of the prognostication. Thus positioned, the dipper handle pointed to a Lunar Lodge and its associated prognostication.

Boards excavated from Fuyang were designed for the specific methods of Liuren 六壬 (Six Ren Days), Jiugong 九宮 (Nine Palaces), and Taiyi 太一 (Great One). These methods incorporate *yin-yang* and Five Agent theory.[37] They link the sexagenary cycle to a hierarchy of divinities, celestial phenomena, the four directions, and human activities and emotions. The effect was to subsume human action under cosmological change.

In summary, the evidence from excavated texts suggests a naturalistic world in which cosmic patterns can be observed and predicted. This evidence appears in the omen statements of *Yi* texts, in daybooks, and in astrocalendric texts and instruments. The hexagrams of the *Zhouyi* and the sexagenary cycle contributed to the systematic, and eventually cosmological orientation Han philosophy, as *yin-yang* and Five-phase theories were applied systematically (and perhaps arbitrarily) to a wide range of phenomena.[38]

III. Embodied Virtue, Self-Cultivation, and Physiognomy

Both Masters texts and excavated texts on physiognomy, health, and longevity describe physical practices for cultivating virtue through the transformation of *qi*. These practices overlap accounts of self-cultivation as originating in the will (*zhi* 志) in the received tradition. These texts have important ramifications for the understanding of early Chinese views of self-cultivation. They also describe its results as manifesting in the physical appearance of the body, visible through physiognomy. Excavated texts address two closely related issues: self-cultivation through the physical cultivation of *qi* within the body and physiognomic methods for reading the physical signs of these practices.

1. Embodied Virtue and Self-Cultivation

Mencius describes virtue as manifesting in the body. At 2A2 he famously describes *qi* as filling the body and moved by the will 志. He argues that its concentration is a function of morality, through accumulated righteousness (*ji yi* 集義). When asked about his own particular strengths, he replies that he understands language and is good at nurturing his flood-like *qi*. But if virtue is visible in the body it can be "read." At 7A21 Mencius describes the virtues of the *junzi* as

visible in the body as a glossy color visible in the face and limbs. At 4A15 he recommends eye physiognomy on grounds that the eyes reveal a person's moral state by the clarity or cloudiness of the pupils. This argument is attacked by both Xunzi and Wang Chong, who argue that clarity or the pupils is determined at birth and does not depend on character. In "Against Physiognomy" (*Fei Xiang* 〈非相〉) Xunzi also argues that physiognomizing people's forms is inferior to speaking of their heart-minds. Poor physiognomy does not prevent correct values, and good physiognomy cannot take the place of incorrect values. What makes us human is the act of making distinctions, which does not depend on physiognomy.[39]

Mencius's views about *qi* conform to and probably draw on a culture of embodied self-cultivation practices, aptly described in a recent book by Mark Csikszentmihalyi.[40] These practices and the concepts behind them structured much of early Daoism, medical theory, and, more broadly, important areas of early Chinese ethics and metaphysics.[41] Such "material virtue" traditions held that the body-mind was constructed of *qi*, which could be transformed by embodied self-cultivation practices. These traditions appear both in the received tradition and in excavated texts.

In the received tradition, accounts of the cultivation of embodied *qi* appear in the *Daodejing*《道德經》, *Zhuangzi*《莊子》, the *Nei Ye* chapter of the *Guanzi*《管子》, and parts of the *Huainanzi*《淮南子》. For example, *Zhuangzi* 1 refers to a *shen ren* 神人 who has effectively transformed his physical body and its constituent *qi*. *Zhuangz*i 11 describes harmonizing the essences of the six *qi* in order to nurture life. According to *Zhuangzi* 22, human birth is caused by the gathering together of *qi*.[42] Fourth-century passages in the *Zuozhuan* and *Guanzi* also describe regulating *qi* to achieve emotional balance.[43] The *Nei ye* and *Lüshi Chunqiu* describe the cultivation of *qi* for wisdom and longevity.[44] Many other passages could be adduced. The point is that a sage or numinous person achieves that status through physical as well as metaphysical means, which are not distinguished. They are part of a "Nurturing Life" (*Yangsheng* 〈養生〉) tradition of physical self-cultivation and longevity techniques such as dietary practices, exercise regimens, breath meditation, and sexual cultivation techniques. These technical traditions were associated with *fangshu* in the received tradition and described in medical manuscripts excavated from tombs. Most do not survive in the received tradition beyond records of their titles in the last two sections of the *Hanshu Yiwenzhi*.

Excavated texts contribute significantly to an emergent view that individuals traditionally described as both Daoist and Ru shared a focus on the mental and physical cultivation of *qi*. This evidence

includes medical manuscripts from Mawangdui, such as the "Drawings of Guiding and Pulling" (*Daoyin Tu* 〈導引圖〉), drawings of human figures performing exercises, some with captions.[45] Some are described in the "Pulling Book" (*Yinshu* 〈引書〉) from Zhangjiashan 張家山, which describes exercises based on imitation of animal movement (snakes, mantises, tigers, dragons, etc.) which may be the earliest known ancestors of contemporary martial arts or *wushu* 武術.[46] Both exemplify a tradition of exercise for both therapy and health known as *daoyin* (pulling and guiding). Other texts from Mawangdui describe dietetics and breath cultivation, for example, "Eliminating Grain and Eating Vapor" (*Quegu Shiqi* 〈卻穀食氣〉) and "Recipes for Nurturing Life" (*Yang Sheng Fang* 〈養生方〉).[47] "Harmonizing *Yin* and *Yang*" (*He Yin Yang* 〈合陰陽〉) and "Discussion of the Culminant Way of All Under Heaven" (*Tianxia Zhidao Tan* 〈天下至道談〉) use the movements and postures of animals to describe sexual techniques. All are part of a *yangsheng* culture, which construed self-cultivation as control over physiological processes of the body and mind, understood as transformations of *qi*. The result was moral excellence, health, and longevity.[48]

Two versions of a text titled *Wuxing* 五行 or "Five Kinds of Action" have been excavated from Mawangdui and Guodian 郭店 (Jingmen, Hubei, 310–300).[49] Csikszentmihaly has argued that the Ru defense against charges of hypocrisy was a moral psychology that provided an account of authentic practice.[50] The *Wuxing* texts provide this through descriptions of the process of how states of the inner mind are transformed by reflection to form virtuous action.[51] It thus presents an opportunity to significantly reread Mencius as part of an "embodied virtue" tradition that spans what have conventionally been classified as distinct "schools" and "genres" (Ru and Daoist, Classics and technical works, etc.).

2. Physiognomy

Physiognomy is also part of the discourse on embodied virtue and potential. In traditional interpretations, Confucian schools emphasized study and ritual and Daoist texts described meditative and longevity practices. In the light of the evidence of excavated texts, both can be viewed as part of a broader tradition of embodied self-cultivation practices. Material virtue traditions had important links with both Ru practices (possibly associated with Zisi 子思) and with Daoist traditions and southern schools, as well as potential links to the moralization of health in the traditions that culminated as the *Huangdi Neijing* 《黃帝內經》. Accounts of these practices appear in

passing in the texts of the received tradition. Many more come from excavated texts.

In the received tradition, physiognomy titles appear in the *shushu* section of the *Hanshu Yiwenzhi*. All are lost, but their titles suggest a focus on practical physiognomy of persons and objects. If the transformed *qi* of a cultivated individual was visible in the body, a skilled individual should be able to "read" these transformations. But the subject matter of physiognomy texts included both physical characteristics that might result from self-cultivation and characteristics set at birth.

The earliest systematic exposition of the principles of physiognomy is in a manuscript from Dunhuang 敦煌 (Gansu, fifth to eleventh centuries CE) ascribed to the Han figure Xu Fu 許負.[52] Physiognomy (*Xiangshu*《相書》) surveys the human body and explains the significance of each feature, especially (i) the form of the body and face and their proportions and appearance and fineness of shape of various parts of the body. In particular, brilliance and luminosity of the face, eyes, and hair portend good health but also good fortune, (ii) "color" of the face especially, but also the color of parts of the body, (iii) birthmarks, especially on the face, head, back, and genitals. Finally, (iv) lines and figures on the face, especially on the forehead, below the nose, on the tongue, hands, and feet. Like the early omen statements, the physiognomic prognostications in the *Xiangshu* are not systematic and are grouped under headings such as face, eyes, nose, and so on. Color attributes appear among the statements, but with no systematic significance. It is striking that some of these features might result from self-cultivation (luminosity, color, and facial lines), but others are set at birth (shape of the limbs, birthmarks, etc.).

In theory at least, the ability to physiognomize persons and things allowed a skilled reader to assess the merit and potential, not only of persons but of animals and plants used in agriculture, and even of materiel used in warfare. Physiognomy could be used to assess the economic worth of objects (clothing, equipment, swords), animals (domestic animal, silkworms), and people. It is not easy to reconstruct the methods used, because many of the passages that mention these arts do so for rhetorical purposes that have no interest in the techniques themselves.[53]

Excavated texts on physiognomy emphasize these practical contexts, for example, a text on physiognomizing dogs from Yinqueshan, a Han sword physiognomy text from *Juyan* 居延, and a text on the physiognomy of horses from Mawangdui.[54] These included animals and plants used in agriculture and even military materiel. All share the view that internal *qi* is reflected in appearance and makes it

possible to judge character or potential. In economic and military contexts this meant judging the "character" of an animal or weapon.

IV. Concluding Remarks

In recent years, our understanding of early Chinese views of divination, fate, and agency has been transformed by new evidence from excavated texts that prominently include mantic and *qi* transformation techniques and texts, presumably used by the occupants of the tombs in which they were found. Such texts fall below the radar of specifically Ru discussions of political agency and political autonomy. Excavated texts clearly demonstrate the ongoing use of technical arts whose nature is suggested by the titles of the *Hanshu Yiwenzhi*. At the government level, mantic techniques were used to determine auspicious days for sacrifices, state ritual, and as part of military and political decision making. As used by private individuals (albeit within networks of relationships), these techniques demonstrate a tacit notion of autonomy, as they were (and are) used as an aid to formulating life plans and act on them by enhancing health, longevity, and efficacy in practical decisions.[55] The private use of these practices presupposes an active agent with desires and life plans. If the contents of high officials' tombs are a guide to what they chose to have buried with them, technical works on longevity and the mantic arts handily outnumber Classics or Masters texts.

In summary, recently excavated archaeological texts have greatly augmented our knowledge of these techniques and brought to light significant elements in Warring States philosophical and religious discourses on self-cultivation. Debates on divination, fate, agency, and responsibility had important implications for Chinese views of personal and moral autonomy. Some tacit notion of personal autonomy is a precondition for the aspiration to affect the future through mantic activity.

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF SINGAPORE
Singapore

Endnotes

Research for this article has been supported by a President's Research Fellowship in the Humanities from the University of California (2005–2006), and a grant from National Endowment for the Humanities and the American Council of Learned Societies for research in China (2006).

1. A. C. Graham, *Yin-Yang and the Nature of Correlative Thinking* (Singapore: Institute of East Asian Philosophies, 1986), 1–2 credited them with the development of

Five-phase cosmology. See also Angus C. Graham, *Disputers of the Tao: Philosophical Argument in Ancient China* (LaSalle: Open Court, 1991), especially 225–35; Ngo Van Xuyet, *Divination Magie et Politique dans la Chine Ancienne* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1976); and Li Ling 李零, *Zhongguo Fangshu Kao*《中國方術考》(Beijing: Renmin Zhongguo Publisher, 1993) and *Zhongguo Fangshu Xukao*《中國方術續考》(Beijing: Renmin Zhongguo, 2000).

2. *Hanshu*, 30 (Beijing: Zhonghua, 1962), 1701–84. It was compiled by Ban Gu (32–92 CE). The first four sections were based on Liu Xin's 劉歆 46 BCE–23 CE) description of the imperial library, but the two technical sections (*shushu* 數術 and *fangji* 方技, Recipes and Methods) were compiled by two technical experts: the Grand Astrologer Yin Xian 尹咸 and the imperial physician Li Zhuguo 李柱國. Dating: A. F. P. Hulsewé in Michael Loewe, ed., *Early Chinese Texts: A Bibliographical Guide* (Berkeley: Society for the Study of Early China and The Institute of East Asian Studies, University of California, Berkeley, 1993), 129–36. Discussion: Marc Kalinowski, "Technical Traditions in Ancient China and Shushu Culture in Chinese Religion," in *Volume 1: Ancient and Medieval*, *Religion and Chinese Society*, ed. John Lagerwey (Hong Kong: Chinese University Press, 2004), 223–48. For critical study of the *Yiwenzhi* see Wang Xianqian 王先謙, *Hanshu Buzhu*《漢書補注》(Changsha: Xushou Tang, 1900. Facs. repr. Beijing: Shumu Wenxian, 1995) and Gu Shi 顧實 (1875–1956), *Hanshu Yiwenzhi Jiang Shu*《漢書藝文志講疏》(Shanghai: Shangwu Publisher, 1924, rpt. Shanghai: Guji Publisher, 1987).
3. All dates are BCE unless otherwise indicated. Chen Songchang 陳松長 and Liao Mingchun 廖名春, "*Boshu 'Ersanzi Wen,' 'Yi zhi Yi,' 'Yao' Shiwen* 帛書二三子問易之義，要釋文," *Daojia Wenhua Yanjiu*《道家文化研究》3 (1993): 435.
4. *Lüshi Chunqiu Jiaoshi*《呂氏春秋校釋》, ed. Chen Qiyou 陳奇猷 (Shanghai: Xuelin Publisher, 1984), 1505 (*Yi Xing* 壹行 22.4). Richard Wilhelm translates *Bi* as "Grace," Richard John Lynn as "Elegance." See Richard Wilhelm, *The I Ching or Book of Changes*, trans. Cary F. Baynes (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1950), 90 and Richard John Lynn, *The Classic of Changes: A New Translation of the I Ching as Interpreted by Wang Bi* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1994), 274.
5. This double-character name may refer to an office in the *Zhouli*. The *wuma* was in charge of the medical treatment of horses. See *Zhouli* (*Shisanjing zhushu* ed., comp. Ruan Yuan, 1815, facs. rpt. Taipei: Yiwen Jushu Publisher, 1980), 33.6b–8a.
6. *Lüshi Chunqiu*, 1441 ("Chai Xian 察賢," 21.2, cf. John Knoblock and Jeffrey Riegel, *The Annals of Lü Buwei: A Complete Translation and Study* [Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 2000], 553). Fu Zijian 宓子賤 was the nickname of Fu Buqi 宓不齊 (b. 521). Wuma Qi was the style name of Wuma Shi 巫馬施, who succeeded Fu Buqi in Shanfu 單父 in Lu in southwest Shandong. Confucius also praises him in the *Analects*, 5.3. For another example, see for example, *Mozi Jiaozhu*《墨子校注》, *Xinbian Zhuzi Jicheng*《新編諸子集成》ed. (Beijing: Zhonghua Publisher, 1993), 46.656–61.
7. *Zhuangzi Jishi*《莊子集釋》, ed. Guo Qingfan 郭慶藩 (Beijing: Zhonghua Publisher, 1961) 23.785. An almost identical passage appears in *Daode Jing*, 44: "Therefore if you understand what is enough you will not be humiliated; If you know when to stop you will not be in danger and will be able to be long lasting." This passage also recommends simplicity, but does not mention divination.
8. *Guanzi* 管子 (*Sibu Beiyao* edition), 16.5a ("*Nei Ye*" 16.49), trans. modified from Rickett 2.50–51. The same question appears in *Guanzi* 13.6a ("*Xinshu Xia*〈心術下〉," 13.37; W. Allyn Rickett, trans., *Guanzi: Political, Economic and Philosophical Essays from Early China*, vol. 2 [Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998], 60).
9. *Guanzi*, 13.10a ("*Bai Xin*," 13.38, cf. Rickett, *Guanzi* vol. 2, 89).
10. *Mozi*, 68.894–5; *Guanzi*, 12.20a ("*Yi Mi*〈侈靡〉," 12.35) and 22.4ab ("*Shan Quan*〈山權數〉," 22.75).
11. *Xunzi Jijie*《荀子集解》(Beijing: Zhonghua, 1988), 17.316 ("*Tian Lun*〈天論〉"). *Hanfeizi Jishi*《韓非子集釋》, ed. Chen Qiyou 陳奇猷 (Beijing: Zhonghua Publisher, 1958), 1102–3 ("*Xian Xue*〈顯學〉," 19.50).
12. *Zhangjiashan Hanmu Zhujian* (*Ersiqi Hao Mu*) 張家山漢墓竹簡 (二十七號墓)》(Beijing: Wenwu Publisher, 2001), 203–4, slips 474–86. For context see Li Xueqin

李學勤 and Xing Wen 邢文, "New Light on the Early-Han Code: A Reappraisal of the *Zhangjiashan* Bamboo-Slip Legal Texts," *Asia Majo*r 14, no. 1 (2001): 125–46.

13. For Tianxingguan see *Wenwu*, 2001, no. 9: 4–21 and *Jingzhou Tianxingguan Erhao Chumu*《荊州天星觀二號楚墓》(Beijing: Wenwu Publisher, 2003). For Wangshan, see *Jiangling Wangshan Shazhong Chumu*《江陵望山沙塚楚墓》(Beijing: Wenwu Publisher, 1996).
14. Chen Wei 陳偉, *Baoshan Chu Jian Chutan*《包山楚簡初探》(Wuhan: Wuhan University Press, 1996).
15. *Baoshan Chujian*《包山楚簡》(Beijing: Wenwu Publisher, 1991), slips 197–98. This passage presents many complications and controversies. Translation follows Chen Wei, *Baoshan Chu Jian Chutan*《包山楚簡初探》, 231. He transcribes *geng* 庚 as *di* 帝 and reads it as *shi* 適, "to go." Transcription follows *Baoshan Chujian* as much as possible. I have used modern orthography to render what in the original were compound graphs (e.g., 之月，躬身) or have used later equivalents of Chu script characters (e.g., *xing* 刑 for a Chu graph consisting of *xing* 刑 with the element *tian* 田 under it and *shi* 尸 for the Chu graph consisting of *shi* 尸 with the element *shi* 示 under it). For another translation see and Constance Cook, *Death in Ancient China: The Tale of One Man's Journey* (Leiden: Brill, 2006), 154–55.
16. For this distinction see Chen Wei, *Baoshan Chu Jian Chutan*《包山楚簡初探》, 152–54. Of the twenty-seven entries, eleven are Year divinations; twelve concern illness and the others do not involve divination. Although the ritualists specialize in method and instrument, they do not specialize in Year or Illness divination. Eight perform Year divination, three exclusively; four perform Illness divination exclusively, and four perform both Year and Illness divination. See Lisa Raphals, "Divination and Medicine in China and Greece: A Comparative Perspective on the Baoshan Illness Divinations," *East Asian Science, Technology and Medicine* 24 (2005): 78–103.
17. *Baoshan*, slips 207–8, in Cook, *Death in Ancient China*, 168–69. This repeats in four entries dated to the eleventh month of the same year (slips 218 and 220).
18. Cf. Michael J. Puett, *To Become a God: Cosmology, Sacrifice and Self-Divinization in Early China* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2002).
19. Mu-chou Poo, *In Search of Personal Welfare: A View of Ancient Chinese Religion* (New York: State University of New York Press, 1998), 27–29.
20. Astronomical treatises: *Huainanzi*, 3: *Tianwenxun*〈天文訓〉; "*Tianwenzhi*〈天文志〉," *Shiji*, 27; "*Tianwenzhi*〈天文志〉," *Hanshu*, 26. "The Pitch Pipes" (*Lü Shu*《律書》), *Shiji*, 25. The Five Agents: *Wuxingzhi*〈五行志〉, *Hanshu*, 27.
21. Major sites: Sipanmo 四盤磨 (Anyang, Anhui), Qishan 岐山 (Shaanxi, the Zhouyuan oracle bones), and Zhangjiapo 張家坡, near present-day Xian.
22. Zhang Zhenglang 張政烺, "*Shishi Zhou Chu Qingtongqi Mingwen Zhong de Yi Gua* 試釋周初青銅器銘文中的易卦," *Kaogu Xuebao*, 1980, no. 4: 403–15, trans. Horst R. Huber, Robin D. B. Yates et al., "An Interpretation of the Divinatory Inscriptions on Early Chou Bronzes," *Early China* 6 (1980): 80–96. Zhang Yachu 張亞初 and Liu Yu 劉雨, "*Cong Shang Zhou Bagua Shu Zi Fuhao Tan Shi Fa de Jige Wenti* 從商周八卦數字元號談筮法的幾個問題," *Kaogu*, 1981, no. 2: 155–63 and 154, trans. Edward Shaughnessy, "Some Observations about Milfoil Divination Based on Shang and Zhou Bagua Numerical Symbols," *Early China* 7 (1981–1982): 46–54.
23. Slip 198 as transcribed in *Wenwu*, 1995, no. 1: 41. This hexagram corresponds to Hexagram 60 (*Jie* 節 ["Articulation"]) in the transmitted tradition. Most "*Guicang*〈歸藏〉" hexagram names correspond to the received *Yijing*; the exceptions resemble the Mawangdui *Zhou Yi*. The Wangjiatai *Guicang* also resembles extant portions of the *Guicang*. See Wang Mingqin 王明欽, "*Wangjiatai Qinmu Zhujian Gaishu* 王家台秦墓竹簡概述," in *Xinchu Jianbo Yanjiu*《新出簡帛研究》(Studies on Recently-Discovered Chinese Manuscripts), ed. Sarah Allan and Xing Wen (Beijing: Wenwu Publisher, 2004), 26–49 and 441–43.
24. Han Ziqiang 韓自強, *Fuyang Hanjian "Zhouyi" Yanjiu*《阜陽漢簡《周易》研究》(Shanghai: Guji Publisher, 2004), 53 slip 64; 59, slip 125.
25. Ibid., 54, slip 69.
26. Ma Chengyuan 馬承源 and Shanghai Bowuguan 上海博物館, *Shanghai Bowuguan Cang Zhanguo Chu Zhu Shu*《上海博物館藏戰國楚竹書》, vol. 3 (Shanghai: Guji

Publisher, 2003), 131–260. See also Liao Mingchun 廖名春, "*Cong Guodian Chu Jian Lun Xian Qin Ru Jia yu 'Zhouyi' de Guannian* 從郭店楚簡論先秦儒家與《周易》的關係," *Hanxue Yanjiu* 18, no. 1 (2000): 55–72; Liao Mingchun 廖名春 and Zhu Yuanqing 朱淵清 ed., *Shang Boguan Cang Zhanguo Chu Zhu Shu Yanjiu*《上博館藏戰國楚簡書研究》(Shanghai: Shanghai Shudian Publisher, 2002); Pu Maozuo 濮茅左, *Chu Zhushu Zhou Yi Yanjiu: Jian Shu Xian Qin Liang Han Chutu yu Chuanshi Yi Xue Wenxian Ziliao*《楚竹書周易研究: 兼述先秦兩漢出土與傳世易學文獻資料》, 2 vols. (Shanghai: Guji Publisher, 2006); Shaughnessy, "A First Reading of the Shanghai Museum Bamboo-Strip Manuscript of the *Zhou Yi*," *Early China* 30 (2005–2006): 1–24, especially 23–24.

27. For more on mantic activity and risk see Raphals, *Divination in Early China and Greece* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, forthcoming).
28. Strictly speaking, an almanac is an annual table or book of tables with a monthly calendar of days, that gives the locations of each planet in the zodiac throughout the year and other astronomical, astrological, and meteorological information. The term is more generally used for systems that combine cosmological and calendric principles, including *Yueling*〈月令〉(Monthly Ordinance) calendars in the *Guanzi*, *Lüshi Chunqiu*, *Huainanz*i, and *Liji*.
29. Especially Jiudian 九店 (Jiangling, Hubei, *c*. 330–270), Shuihudi 睡虎地 (Yunmeng 雲夢, Hubei, 217), Fangmatan 放馬灘 (Tianshui, Gansu, *c*. 230–220), Mawangdui, and Zhoujiatai 周家台 (Guanju 關沮, Hubei, 213–209), summarized in Kalinowski, "Divination and Astrology: Received Texts and Excavated Manuscripts," in *China's Early Empires: A Re-appraisal*, ed. Michael Nylan and Michael Loewe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 339–66 and 353–59.
30. Different daybooks use different calendric principles, including the Stem-branch (*ganzhi* 干支) cycle, the *jianchu* 建除 (Establishment and Removal) series and cycles of Sanctions and Virtues (*xingde* 刑德).
31. Mu-chou Poo, *Search of Personal Welfare*, 72–89. For risk, see Raphals, *Divination in Early China and Greece*, chapter 8.
32. *Jiudian Chumu*《九店楚墓》, ed. Hubeisheng Wenwu Kaogu Yanjiusuo (Beijing: Wenwu, 1999), 52–53, slips 64 and 67, cf. Donald Harper, "Iatromancy, Prognosis, and Diagnosis in Early Chinese Medicine," in *Innovation in Chinese Medicine*, ed. Elisabeth Hsu, Needham Research Institute Studies 3 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 99–120, especially 105–6.
33. *Shuihudi Qinmu Zhujian*《睡虎地秦墓竹簡》, 193, slips 68–69.
34. East (months 1, 5, and 9), south (months 2, 6, and 10), west (months 3, 7, and 11), and north (months 4, 8, and 12). See Kalinowski, *Cosmologie et Divination dans la Chine Ancienne: le Compendium des Cinq Agents* (Paris: École française d'Extrême Orient, 1991), 105; Liu Lexian 劉樂賢, *Shuihudi Qinjian Rishu Yanjiu*《睡虎地秦簡日書研究》(Taipei: Wenjin Publisher, 1993), 116–22; Harper, "Iatromancy, Prognosis, and Diagnosis," especially 105–13.
35. See Jingzhou Diqu Bowuguan, ed., "Jiangling Wanjiatai 15 hao Qin Mu" 江陵王家15台号秦墓, *Wenwu*, 1995, no. 1: 42.
36. *Guanju Qin Hanmu Jiandu*《關沮秦漢墓簡牘》(Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju Publisher, 2001), 107.
37. The definitive study of Han *Liuren* boards is Kalinowski, "Les instruments astro-calendériques des Han et la methode *liu ren*," *Bulletin de l'Ecole Française d'Extrême-Orient* 72 (1983): 309–419. Recent archaeology: Yan Dunjie 嚴敦傑, "Guanyu Xi-Han *Chuqi de Shipan he Zhanpan* 關於西漢初期的式盤和占盤," *Kaogu Xuebao*, 1978, no. 5: 334–37 and Kalinowski, "Les Traités de Shuihudi et l'Hémérologie Chinoise à la Fin des Royaumes-Combattants," *Toung-pao* 72, no. 4/5 (1986): 175–228, especially 62–72.
38. For detailed discussion, see Raphals, *Divination in Early China and Greece*, chapter 10.
39. *Xunzi*, 5.72–73 78 ("*Fei Xiang* 〈非相〉"); *Lunheng Jiaoshi*《論衡校釋》(Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju Publisher, 1990) 13.135 ("*Ben Xing* 本性").
40. Mark Csikszentmihaly, *Material Virtue: Ethics and the Body in Early China* (Leiden: Brill, 2004).

41. For an excellent summary, see Vivienne Lo, "Self-cultivation and the Popular Medical Traditions," in *Medieval Chinese Medicine: The Dunhuang Medical Manuscripts*, ed. Lo and Christopher Cullen (London: Routledge Curzon, 2005), 207–25.
42. *Zhuangzi Jishi*《莊子集釋》, ed. Guo Qingfan 郭慶藩 (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju Publisher, 1961), 1:28, 11:386, 22:733.
43. *Zuozhuan*, ed. Yang Bojun 楊伯峻 (Gaoxiong: Fuwen Tushu Publisher, 1981), 1458 (*Zhao*, 25.3); *Guanzi* X 26:2a.
44. *Guanzi*, 16.4ab ("Nei Ye," 16.49); *Lüshi Chunqiu*, 136–44 ("*Jin Shu*〈盡數〉," 3.2).
45. *Mawangdui Hanmu Boshu*《馬王堆漢墓帛庭》, ed. Mawangdui Hanmu Boshu Zhengli Xiaozu, vols. 1/2, 3, and 4 (Beijing: Wenwu Publisher, 1980, 1983, and 1985).
46. Zhangjiashan Hanjian Zhengli Xiaozu, ed., "*Zhangjiashan Hanjian yinshu shiwen* 江陵張家山漢簡引書釋文," *Wenwu*, 1990, no. 10: 82–86; Peng Hao 彭浩, "*Zhangjiashan Hanjian Yinshu Chutan*《張家山漢簡引書初探》," *Wenwu*, 1990, no. 10: 87–91.
47. Harper, *Early Chinese Medical Literature* (London and New York: Kegan Paul International, 1998), especially 25–30.
48. See Lo, "The Influence of Nurturing Life Culture," in *Innovation in Chinese Medicine*, ed. Elisabeth Hsu, Needham Research Institute Studies (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).
49. *Mawangdui Hanmu Boshu* vol. 1 (1980), 17–27; *Guodian Chumu Zhujian*《郭店楚墓竹簡》, ed. Jingmenshi Bowuguan (Beijing: Wenwu Publisher, 1998), 147–54 (both translated in two appendices in Csikszentmihalyi, *Material Virtue*). For structural analysis, see Xing Wen 邢文, "*Chujian Wuxing Shilun* 楚簡五行試論," *Wenwu*, 1998, no. 10: 57–61.
50. Most telling is Robber Zhi's critique in *Zhuangzi Jishi*《莊子集釋》, 9. 991–2.
51. Csikszentmihalyi, *Material Virtue*, especially 7, 59, and chapter 5.
52. It survives in three manuscript versions (2572, 2797, 3589). These texts can be accessed at the International Dunhuang Project: http://idp.bl.uk. See Catherine Despeux, "Physiognomie," in *Divination et Société dans la Chine Médiévale: Étude des Manuscrits de Dunhuang de la Bibliothèque Nationale de France et de la British Library*, ed. Kalinowski (Paris: Bibliothèque Nationale de France, 2003), especially 521–23.
53. Raphals, *Divination in Early China and Greece*, chapter 10.
54. Li Ling, *Zhongguo Fangshu kao*, 84–87. The Yinqueshan text includes Recipes for Physiognomizing Dogs (*Xiang Gou Fang*《相狗方》). See Wu Jiulong 吳九龍, *Yinqueshan Hanjian Shiwen*《銀雀山漢簡釋文》(Beijing: Wenwu Publisher, 1985: 243) and slips 208, 213, 221, 242, 261, 271, 302, 315, 374, 889, 899, 1937, 2570, 3788, and 4047. For transcription of the Juyan slips, see *Juyan Xin Jian: Jiaqu Houguan yu Di Si Sui*《居延新簡: 甲渠候官與第四燧》, ed. Gansu Sheng Wenwu Kaogu Yanjiusuo (Beijing: Wenwu Publisher, 1990), 98. For Mawangdui, see "*Mawangdui Hanmu Boshu Xiangma Jing Shiwen* 馬王堆漢墓帛書相馬經釋文," *Wenwu*, 1977, no. 8: 17–22.
55. Here I follow Charles Taylor's discussion of moral status as requiring a sense of self, a point of view, and the capacity to hold values, make choices, and adopt life plans. See Taylor, "The Concept of a Person," in *Human Agency and Language: Philosophical Papers, volume 1* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 97–105. This topic is also pursued in Raphals, "Thirteen Ways of Looking at the Self in Early China," *History of Philosophy Quarterly* 26, no. 4 (2009): 315–36.